



REVIEWERS' COMMENTS

**MANUSCRIPT
TITLE :**

The comments of the reviewers are enclosed for your consideration:

** Please ticks "X"*

NO	ORIGINALITY AND NOVELTY	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Does the paper provide new perspective, new contribution, insights, concepts and methods?			
2.	Does it advance knowledge in the field significantly?			
3.	Is the contribution distinct from previous work?			
4.	Are the research questions innovative?			

NO	RELEVANCE AND SCOPE	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Does the article fit within the aims and scope of Planning Malaysia?			
2.	Is it of broad interest to the field or interdisciplinary in value?			
3.	Does it address current or emerging research priorities?			

NO	SCIENTIFIC RIGOR AND METHODOLOGY	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Is the research design sound and appropriate for the objectives?			
2.	Are methods clearly explained and replicable?			
3.	Is the data robust, well-analyzed and statistically valid?			
4.	Are limitations acknowledged?			

NO	SIGNIFICANCE AND IMPACT	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	What is the theoretical or practical implication of the findings?			
2.	Can it influence policy, practice, or future research?			
3.	Is the citation potential high?			

NO	CLARITY AND STRUCTURE	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Is the paper well-organized, logically structured, and coherent?			
2.	Is the language clear, academic, and concise?			
3.	Are figures, tables, and visuals well-presented and necessary?			



REVIEWERS' COMMENTS

MANUSCRIPT TITLE :

NO	LITERATURE REVIEW AND CONTEXT	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Is the literature review comprehensive and current?			
2.	Does the paper clearly position itself within existing topic?			
3.	Are key references, theories and studies cited appropriately?			

NO	RESULTS AND INTERPRETATION	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Are results clearly presented and supported by evidence?			
2.	Are interpretations logical, justified, reasonable and grounded in data?			

NO	ETHICAL STANDARDS AND COMPLIANCE	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Are conflicts of interest disclosed?			
2.	Are plagiarism and data fabrication/duplication avoided?			
3.	Are ethical approvals or disclosures included if needed?			
4.	Are ethical standards upheld throughout?			

NO	THEORETICAL CONTRIBUTION (FOR CONCEPTUAL PAPERS)	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Does the paper develop or extend a theory?			
2.	Is the conceptual framework coherent and insightful?			

NO	PRESENTATION AND FORMATTING	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	Are formatting and references in line with journal standards?			
2.	Are abstract, keywords, and titles effective for indexing and searchability?			
3.	Is the paper well-organized and easy to follow?			
4.	Is the language academic and clear?			
5.	Are visuals (tables/figures) relevant and well-designed?			



REVIEWERS' COMMENTS

MANUSCRIPT TITLE :

NO	ADDITIONAL CRITERIA FOR Q1 ACCEPTANCE	YES*	NO*	NOT SURE*
1.	International relevance and authorship diversity.			
2.	Preference for multi-disciplinary or cross-border studies.			
3.	Potential for policy influence, societal relevance, or real-world application.			

COMMENTS BY REVIEWERS <i>(Please add remarks in the space provided and use extra sheets if necessary)</i>

The Editorial Board of the Planning Malaysia Journal has decided that the manuscript is:

Accepted without Revision		Accepted with Minor Revision		Accepted with Major Revision		Rejected	
--------------------------------------	--	---	--	---	--	-----------------	--

In order for papers to be published in the Planning Malaysia Journal (PMJ), the following must be fulfilled:

1. All papers must **not exceed 15 pages** in PMJ template
2. All illustrations, **figures and/or tables in the manuscript must be captioned**, in clear black and white (grayscale) and ready for reproduction.
3. The manuscript should include: **Title; Author(s) name and Affiliation, One Corresponding Author; the Abstract; Keywords; Introduction; Methods; Results; Discussion; Acknowledgement, Disclosure Statement and References**. All papers must be formatted according to **PMJ template**.
4. All papers must **not exceed 15 pages** in PMJ template.
5. All papers must adopt **APA style for referencing**.
6. All papers must include citations or refer to at least **2 articles from Planning Malaysia**. Kindly refer to www.planningmalaysia.org/publications for the published articles
7. Author must ensure that all citations are included in the Reference List and vice versa.
8. Author must ensure that your Turnitin result does **NOT exceed 24% similarities** prior publication.
9. Papers related to systematic review or review of literature will normally not be accepted in this journal
10. Revised papers must address all the comments made by reviewers.

We hope that the comments made by the reviewers will be of benefits to authors in revising their papers in order to ensure quality publication. We also would like to reiterate that authors must observe the requirements listed above to ensure their papers will be selected for publication in the Journal.